



## Preservation Challenges of Historical Buildings in Hyderabad, Sindh

Ammara Kaynat\*, Amal Noor Nizami\*\*, Fatima Basharat\*\*\*, Zeeshan Asim\*\*\*\*, Mahrugh Mirza\*\*\*\*\*

\*Lecturer, School of Architecture, University of Lahore. [Ammara.kaynat@arch.uol.edu.pk](mailto:Ammara.kaynat@arch.uol.edu.pk)

\*\*Lecturer, School of Architecture, University of Lahore.

\*\*\*Lecturer, School of Architecture, University of Lahore.

\*\*\*\*Assistant Professor, School of Architecture, University of Lahore.

\*\*\*\*\*Assistant Professor, School of Architecture, University of Lahore.

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article history:

Submitted 04.08.2024

Accepted 10.10.2024

Published 31.12.2024

Volume No. 11

Issue No. II

ISSN (Online) 2414-8512

ISSN (Print) 2311-293X

DOI:

**Keywords:** Heritage,  
Environmental Hazards,  
Inappropriate Maintenance

### ABSTRACT

*Hyderabad being the Capital city of Hyderabad division in Sindh Province, have a rich cultural heritage along with numerous historical structures, Hyderabad is experiencing rapid environmental changes along with rapid urbanization, which causes threats to the integrity of its Historical Architecture. This paper aims to identify the pioneer factors that contribute to the deplorable condition of these structures, which can be environmental hazards, inappropriate maintenance, and poor legal protection. Pilot study explores the challenges faced by Hyderabad in preserving its history which includes qualitative & quantitative approach. Tentatively results shows that biggest challenges in conservation includes lack of training, lack of skilled labor along with some other technical issues. This research project will be the foundation for more comprehensive research that will strive to increase public understanding towards the value of cultural heritage preservation and to encourage collaborations in the defense of these historical assets.*



### Introduction

Economic development is a benefit of urbanization, but rapid and unplanned growth can lead to urban sprawl and illegal encroachment. (El Menchawy et al., 2011). Encroachment is a problem, which is faced by whole Sindh specially throughout Hyderabad, it welcome other several issues including traffic congestion, poor sewerage systems, along with poor infrastructure. One can easily experience the disasters caused by encroachment & legal manmade structure in Hyderabad, that not only effect the tourism, culture but also devastated the rich heritage of City. Sindh, being the second largest province of Pakistan, houses nearly 3000 historical sites (Panhwar, 2018), that needs to get registered, documented & preserve but unfortunately due to so many administrative, social, economic factors, 95% of these heritage sides are under poor condition and need prompt action in order to control the decay & decomposition of these Marvels.

According to a report issued in 2019, UNESCO claimed that by 2020 69% world's population will move to the urban areas, as a result we will be experiencing Economic growth, development along with population boost, but here we would be required to develop new rules, regulations & development plans for implementation. Preference must be given to conservation & preservation of our heritage. Contrastingly, tourism industry has witnessed uprising growth in past few years, it has become leading business industry in the world with a 104% growth rate. Archeological tourism along with cultural heritage is also making its way up, leading a pace of 25% growth ratio for overseas tourist in 2021, as per World Travel and Tourism Council report issued in 2021, tourism directly or indirectly impacts the socio economical condition throughout the world, not only by providing job opportunities but indirectly by bringing development for a city. Tourism industry in 2021, welcomed 334 million job opportunities by adding 104% to the world's

GDP (Global Economic Impact and Trends, 2021), and its expected to reach up to 600 million by 2027. In 2020, Pakistan was ranked as the best tourist destination, it has the 3<sup>rd</sup> highest tourism potential in the world. In 2025, according to the tourism ministry, tourism will contribute around 1 trillion Rs to GDP. Heritage & cultural tourism largely contributes to Pakistan's tourist destination. In Pakistan Tourism is divided into five major parts i.e. Adventurous, Ecotourism, Religious, Historical, Archeological (Arshad et al., 2017).

Culture & heritage shape up the identity of any area or city, Historical sites offer to exhibit social, historical, architectural & heritage values (Cohen, 1999). We can experience the ignorance towards the preservation of heritage, there is a major shift in urban landscape, building materials, streetscapes dynamics due to the demand of stakeholders. Urbanization & development doesn't mean to be destructive for the city rather being unorganized, ungoverned & uncertain growth its mean to be constructive in shaping the whole infrastructure of a city. Half cooked or inadequate awareness towards the heritage welcomes problems that are threat to intangible & tangible heritage (Persson, 2004).

Sindh is rich in culture & archeological heritage, it houses 3000 old Indus valley civilization & have 300 monuments & sites protected under the provincial, Sindh Cultural Heritage (Protection) Act 1994 (GoS, 2022). Hyderabad is the second largest city in the province with a population of 1,926,000, with a 2.07% growth rate (United Nations World Population Prospects, n.d.). Hyderabad was once considered as the historical capital of Sindh. (Bux Peerzade et al., 2018). The richness can be witness from the historical marvels of Kuccha & Pukka Qila, Badshahi Bangalow, the tombs of Kalhoru and Talpur rulers, Mukhi House, Basant Hall, clock house, libraries, madrassas, and palaces (Jatt, 2016). Due to negligence of authorities & lack of basic knowledge regarding the value of these sites, all of these historical monuments are under threat. Their condition is deteriorating due to rapid influx of the population to the urban center (Panhwar, 2018). In countries like Pakistan, urbanization has increase at a ground breaking rate (McGaffin et al., 2014). We can witness the increasing population rate, in FY 2022 the density was increased by 1.91% from FY 2021, the population of Hyderabad is increasing day by day, Hyderabad takes the lead in list of urban population density with 40,000 people km<sup>2</sup> (Peerzade et al., 2019). This leading urbanization poses threats to the unique art, culture & historical significance containing sites. (J. Wang, 2012). In last decade a large number of people migrated from rural to urban cities, creating higher number & density of people in metropolises in Pakistan. (Kaka. Z et al., 2021; Statista, 2021) Negligence of authorities, stakeholders & pathetic law enforcement measures has left the cultural heritage & monumental sites in deteriorated condition. (Z. Wang et al., 2019). Hyderabad being the second-largest provincial economic hub, urbanization has accelerated to multifold in recent decades (UNDP, 2019). This research aims to list down the major architectural heritage sites (from each decade, 18<sup>th</sup> to 20<sup>th</sup> century) defining their Architectural styles, era, area, pictures along with the conservation work that has been done so far along with the issues that faced during conservation work due to which these sites are still in that particular deplorable state, creating a lack of tourist interest, indirectly effecting the overall social, economic & tourism industry of Hyderabad.

## **Literature Review**

In current society, the cast about worth of specifically heritage & cultural building has become the momentous concern (Ahmad, G., 2006) Tuan (1977) in his research he reminded that heritage buildings have historical features which serve as tangible aspects for heritage. According to (Cresswell, 2004; Hubbard & Kitchin, 2010) the physical features of any Heritage structure, surpasses the aesthetical gratitude by providing you "sense of place". Conservation can be defined as the preservation of existing edifices, not to alter or destroy their details, although repairs or modifications would be significant. (Curl, 2000). Curl in 2000, claim that conservation & preservation of heritage is delicate as we have to consider the original fabric as much as possible, & to distinguish it through changes made at the time of preservation. Conservation of heritage buildings allows to maximize the character of building, that can help in prolong the building life & its utilization. Conservation is hard as it requires strict rules & regulation in term of procedures. This paper aims to list down the maximum possible structures of different era at Sindh, that's been neglected due to several reasons, along with reviewing the challenges faced by conservations in process of preserving these architectural marvels, generalized large survey is conducted in order to bridge up a knowledge gap regarding the number of architectural buildings, Sindh have & to highlight challenges in order to get hands on further research in future.

## **Research Methodology**

The qualitative research method was adopted. Due to the exploratory nature of topic, mixed methodology has been adopted, several documents along with research papers were reviewed, and relevant literature was reviewed, along with some official reports & documents. The official documents like the copy of the tourism guide Act, travel agency act, Sindh Cultural Heritage (Preservation) Act, 1994, and UNESCO's World Heritage Convention were reviewed during the research. The research also included some

descriptive & ethnographic documentation to identify the existing problems faced by historical buildings in Hyderabad.

## **Result & Discussion**

### **Climatic Issues**

Environmental difficulties are problems brought on by outside forces like the state of the economy, the location and condition of buildings, commercial opportunities, and intervention from third parties. One of the challenges to the preservation of heritage structures becomes a major shift for the economic development, which put pressure on both urban and rural areas to grow (Fidler, 2005). Despite the fact that historic building and site conservation has been extensively studied, it has been hampered by the idea that it is a sector where inventions are made rather than one where they are only applied in cutting-edge technologies. (Fidler, 2005).

Building capacity to comfortably and efficiently house households and businesses is hampered by functional and physical obsolescence (Heath et al., 2013; Fidler, 2005). Consequently, there is a marked decline in the demand and value for these buildings in the historic center real estate markets, which will eventually cause them to become economically obsolete. When a building's physical qualities make it unprofitable to continue operating, it is said to be economically obsolescent. The building's location on land that would have appreciated in value puts economic pressure on it to make room for more recent construction that would better utilize the property's potential. To develop office buildings or high-rise housing on the site of single-family residences is a common example of economic obsolescence. Urban regeneration has emerged as a key component of urban development policies in Portugal and other European nations, with the aim of reversing the current trend of the physical and social deterioration of urban center areas in major cities (Ribiero, 2008). There has been minimal coordination and collaboration between public sector and private agents despite the rise of these public efforts (CML, 2004). Because of the high land values and property taxes in central locations, buildings there are subject to significant pressure for redevelopment (Heritage Committee Calgary, 1978). Due to their central locations, the properties offer excellent opportunities for important applications, are highly sought-after sites for urban economic activity, and have high land values and property taxes. However, in terms of business effectiveness, buildings outside of central locations struggle to survive.

Poor relative location may lessen the threat of redevelopment, but it will make it harder for customer-oriented enterprises to operate if they are not close to marketplaces, competitors, and pedestrian traffic, according to the Municipal Heritage Conservation Framework. Older sites usually have fewer parking spaces and have trouble being accessible by car, which makes it harder for any business to operate there and lowers the value of the property. Accordingly, a historic building's chances of surviving depend on its location (Kenny, 2006).

### **Human Issues**

Human errors, being one of the major challenges in conservation play an error-oriented issue, among human issue, miscommunication regarding different organizational & corporate culture is common, it is due to involvement of multiple experts including contractors, sub-contractors, suppliers and consultants when assembles together to form a crew, (Reyers and Mansfield, 2000). Inadequate coordination among experts, artisans, along with manual laborers leads to disparities in task definitions due to misconstrued directions or divergent comprehension of the extent of the job. Conflicts within the team arise from disparities in contingent power and hazy boundaries. Correct application of the principles and procedures of historic building conservation is further complicated by strict bylaw regulations and building codes. A significant portion of issues stemmed from poorly planned and improper repairs made recently (Oxley, 1999; Kayan, 2003). Poor knowledge on the part of the persons and organizations responsible for maintaining and conserving historic structures is a major issue in the field of historic building conservation, since it can result in the early loss of significant historic fabric. (Kayan, 2003). Professionals in the building industry were especially ignorant when it came to not knowing how to distinguish between new and ancient buildings. As a result, choices about conservation tactics and particular repairs were made without sufficient knowledge. According to the Society for American Archaeology (SAA, 2000), a typical problem that occurs during the management of heritage buildings is due to lack of legal, technical & theoretical attention towards conservation process.

### **Technical Issues**

One of the challenges is the resources scarcity & lack of finances (Worthing and Dann, 2000; Kenny, 2006). Due to insufficient resources for redevelopment of building into adaptive reuse, leave building neglected. Shortage of skilled labor & material to replicate craft & reproduce materials. (Fidler, 2005). It was discovered that due to unavailability of skilled labor & conservation skills for conservation & preservation of

heritage are conducted by inexperienced labor, that results in several issues that are reflected by after effects. (Kayan, 2003; Fidler, 2005). According to European Heritage Network (2009) scars training regarding preservation & conservation along with skill training & expertise along with lack of manpower to facilitate appropriate M & R are the problems that results in discouraging the conservation of heritage.

### **Organizational Issues**

Major challenges found during conservation are due to organizational issues, associated with beliefs, values which control actions & behavior. Organizational structure & Culture led to diverse approach about conservation, from the stringent self-restraint of archaeologists to the assertive confidence of the creative architect. (Kamal, 2008). Worthing and Dann (2000) claimed as we can find a lot of data about conservation methodology, but there is lack of consolidated data defining the purpose of conservation of built heritage that can reflect upon the process.

### **Financial Issues**

According to (Reyers and Mansfield, 2000), due to uncertain circumstances at site, the conservation project cost remains difficult to establish. According to Raftery (1994), It is nearly impractical to quote a perfect cost for a project that's still under construction phase, even when the labor is not enlisted, with inappropriate & incomplete knowledge. The increased in provisional costs is due to assumptions made in preservation project. The project requires public resources through effective coordination of public agencies along with public-private partnerships, as Banks do not approve loans for conservation of specific buildings (Rojas, 1999).

### **Line of Action**

Line of Action that must be followed by the concern persons & Departments may vary, but here are the findings of this research regarding the line of action to be taken in order to minimize the intangible disaster caused by negligence towards these heritage sites.

### **Hurdles**

<b>Limited Budget &amp; Funding</b>	Appropriate financial resources for maintenance & restoration would be a huge challenge, restricted financial resources lead to detaining of conservation work.
<b>Scarcity of skilled personnel</b>	There is a certain lack of professionals including architects, restoration experts, historians, conservationist along with archeologist, that impacts the progress & quality of preservation.
<b>Urban Development</b>	Expeditious development & rapid urbanization lead the heritage sites to encroachment & alteration or even demolition.
<b>Insufficient Documentation</b>	Another challenge faced during preservation & conservation of these site is the incomplete documentation of these sites that effect the planning & execution strategies.
<b>Preservation Constraint</b>	M & R for any initial restored building is necessary to avoid sudden or uncertain re-deterioration of heritage.
<b>Deficit Technologies</b>	Scarce means of advancement in preservation technologies obstruct the constructive development in conservation procedures.
<b>Cultural Consideration</b>	Historical & cultural sensitivities while preforming reservation requires cautious scrutiny to avoid any inconvenience to the neighborhood or the local community

### **Future Recommendation**

Future recommendation for conducting research on challenges may include:

#### **Comprehensive Documentation**

Comprehensive documentation of maximum historical structures, that may include architectural drawings, historical briefs & records, along with the photographs in order to ensure adequate & accurate restoration or preservation.

#### **Community Engagement**

Engaging local communities in the preservation & restoration process in order to get them aware about the tangible & intangible value of these historical marvels.

#### **Adaptive Reuse**

Adaptive reuse of heritage sites, for UpToDate purposes can ensure not only the relevance with the modern world but it can also help in building a good narrative between the historical & modern context in the world of Tourism & Architecture

#### **Policy and Legislation**

Advance policy making along with advancement in heritage protection laws & policies must be conducted, in order to get world class heritage restoration of these properties.

#### **Interdisciplinary Collaboration**

Interdisciplinary collaboration between Conservationists, Historians, Architects & Archeologists in order to develop strategies that can address various challenges comprehensively along with the solutions.

#### **Education and Awareness**



Increase in public awareness on school, college & other institutional level can boost the knowledge regarding the value of heritage sites along with the preservation through campaigns, workshops & conferences

### **Funding and Resources**

Conversion of heritage sites in museums & other entertainment & experiential spaces can help in raising funds that can be further utilized for heritage preservation. On the other hand, secure funding, an appropriate fixed number of resources by government can do a lot more in this field.

### **Conclusion**

This paper, highlighted the urge to give attention to all the heritage sites of Sindh, this paper focus on potential these sites hold for cultural & economic diversity of Sindh, it also emphasizes the current neglected state of these site. Preserving these sites will not only help in restoring the historical magnitude of the city but its significance for enhancing Sindh's heritage tourism for Global reputation.

Preserving Sindh's cultural & heritage sites is not about appreciating the forgotten past but its about building future where the new generation can see how culture, history & community can thrive together. Taking immediate action can ensure that we will not lose them and also it will become the pedigree of pride & prosperity for the coming generations.

### **References**

- Ahmad, G. (2006, November/December). Sejarah@Malaysia. Rangka kerja pemuliharaan bangunan bersejarah .
- Berg, B. L. (2004). Qualitative research methods for the social sciences (Vol. 5). Boston, MA: Pearson.
- Cresswell, T. (2004). Place: A Short Introduction. London: Blackwell.
- Dane, F. C. (2010). Evaluating research: methodology for people who need to read research. Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE.
- Ellison, S. L., Farrant, T. J., & Barwick, V. (2009). Practical statistics for the analytical scientist: A bench guide. Cambridge: Royal Society of Chemistry.
- European Heritage Network: Serbia. (2009, November 29). Heritage conservation. Retrieved February 22, 2010, from South East European <http://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/serbia.php?aid=422>
- Feilden, B. M. (1982). The principles of conservation. In C. o. Monuments, conservation of historic stone buildings and monuments (pp. 22-48). Washington: National Academy Press.
- Fidler, J. (2005). Construction research & innovation in the heritage sector. Foresight planning for a research strategy for the construction industry. English Heritage.
- Heath, T., Oc, T., & Tiesdell, S. (2013). Revitalising historic urban quarters. London: Routledge.
- Heritage Committee Calgary. (1978). Municipal heritage conservation framework. Calgary: Calgary City Council.
- Hubbard, P., & Kitchin, R. (2010). Key thinkers on space and place. London: SAGE.
- Kamal, K. S. (2008). Pendekatan dalam kerja pemuliharaan bangunan bersejarah di Malaysia: Satu tinjauan umum. CD Proceedings: Post Graduate Research Colloquium. Penang, Malaysia: HBP, University Sains Malaysia.
- Kamal, K. S. (2008). Preserving the architectural heritage in the refurbishment of Batu Gajah district court complex, Perak, Malaysia. Delegate Manual Of The Oxford Conference 2008, 22-23rd. July 2008, Examination Schools, University Of Oxford, UK (P. P04.05). Oxford: University of Oxford.
- Kayan, (2003) Conservation of heritage buildings: maintaining old government buildings in Kuala Lumpur after gazetted period. Prosiding Seminar Jangka Pendek. Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya.
- Kenny, P. (2006). Developing a best practice model for the re-use and regeneration of vacant nuildings at rosk in the context of a world heritage site. Bean Conference. Liverpool: John Moores University.
- Oxley, R. (1999). Mistaken protection. SPAB news, 20(2), 16-19.
- Reyers, J., & Mansfield, J. (2000). Conservation refurbishment projects: a comparative assessment of risk management approach. In The Cutting Edge-The Real Estate Research Conference of the RICS Research Foundation.
- Ribeiro, F. L. (2008). Urban regeneration economics: The case of Lisbon's old downtown. International Journal of Strategic Property Management, 12(3), 203-213.
- Society for American Archaeology (SAA). (2000, July 1). Chapter 8: Social issues and the field of archaeological heritage preservation. Retrieved February 22, 2010
- Tuan, Y. F. (1977). Space and place: the perspective of experience. London: Edward Arnold Ltd. Worthing, D., & Dann, N. (2000). Approaches to the repair of traditional timber-framed buildings: the application of conservation philosophy into practice. Structural Survey, 18(4), 136-147.